

## Proposal Comparison for City of Gautier

### Management and Operations of Water, Wastewater, and Public Works

Criteria	Utility Partners, LLC	Clearwater Solutions, LLC
<b>Qualifications</b>	<p>Robert Monette, PE- President (40 years as PE)</p> <p>Bobby Knesal, PE- Sr. VP (30 years as PE)</p> <p>Derrel Wilson, RLS- Reg. Mgr. (40 years)</p> <p>Barry Walker, Sr. VP of PW (30 years)</p> <p>Bill Douglass, VP of Process Operations (30 yr.)</p> <p>Dave Sircle, Atlantic Region Mgr. (25 yr.)</p> <p>(See Section 2, pp.3-5)</p>	<p>Rick Ailiff, President (28 yr.)</p> <p>Paul Jackson, VP (21 yr.)</p> <p>Kody Walker, PE- Area Mgr. for Gautier (8 yr experience)</p> <p>Chad Jordan, PE- Project Engineer (10 yr)</p> <p>-has experience with Gautier projects</p> <p>Bill Cook - Environment Health &amp; Safety Dir. (6 yr)</p> <p>Steve Cawood, PE-Goodwyn, Mills &amp; Cawood (30 yr)</p> <p>-Brown water resolution experience</p> <p>(See Section 3, pp. 9-10)</p>
<b>Experience</b>	<p><b>Public Works:</b></p> <p>Pascagoula (6 yr.)</p> <p>Long Beach (5 yr.)</p> <p>Gulfport (1 yr.)</p> <p>Sandy Springs, GA (7 yr.)</p> <p>Johns Creek, GA (6 yr.)</p> <p>Milton, GA (6 yr.)</p> <p><b>Water Production:</b></p> <p>40+ water/wastewater treatment facilities in VT, GA, FL, NH, and MS including Pascagoula, Moss Point, Long Beach and Gulfport (over 800 miles of distribution)</p> <p><b>Billing:</b></p> <p>Currently bill for nearly 25,000 customers in several states</p> <p><b>Collection Systems:</b></p> <p>Manages 660 miles of sewers in NC, NH, MA, VT, GA, FL and MS including Pascagoula, Long Beach, and Gulfport</p> <p>(See Section 3, pp. 1-6)</p>	<p>City of Hoover, AL- Wastewater (5yr.)</p> <p>North Choctaw Water &amp; Sewer Authority, AL- (10 yr)</p> <p>Governmental Utility Services Corp.- Mobile, AL (5 yr)</p> <p>Perry County Water Authority, AL (5 yr)</p> <p>Wilcox Co. Water System, AL (5 yr)</p> <p>Hanceville Water &amp; Sewer Bd., AL (3 yr)</p> <p>TN Dept of Corrections</p> <p>Safety Net Academy- Camden, AL</p> <p>Mobile Co. Schools</p> <p>Macon Co. Greyhound Pike-Shorter, AL</p> <p>Hale County Water, AL (10 yr)</p> <p>Greenville Water &amp; Sewer Bd., AL (2 yr)</p> <p>Coosa Valley Water Supply District, AL (3)</p> <p>Smiths Water &amp; Sewer Authority, AL (5)</p> <p>Horn Lake Water Assoc., MS (10 yr)</p> <p>(See Section 1, pp. 5-14)</p>
<b>Alignment w/Goals, Needs</b>	<p>Understands City's goals:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-cost effective operations and maintenance services</li> <li>-firm must be trustworthy and competent</li> <li>-must provide a superior level of service to citizens.</li> <li>-UP has local experience, expertise, &amp; depth of staff support to benefit City</li> <li>-can provide a successful Public Works transition.</li> </ul> <p>(See Section 1, pp. 1-4)</p>	<p>Understands City's goals:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-efficient operations</li> <li>-alleviate the Brown Water and Bemis Ave. issues</li> <li>-streamline operations</li> <li>-citizen confidence in their drinking water</li> <li>-saving money</li> <li>-no hidden costs</li> </ul>




Criteria	Utility Partners, LLC	Clearwater Solutions, LLC
<b>Programming, Staffing &amp; Operations Plan</b>	<p>UP, LLC is based in Gulfport with branch offices in 9 other states.  350 staff working in South MS currently.  All City staff given first consideration-must pass pre-employment drug physical and have acceptable driving record.  Will begin implementing quality control, maintenance mgt. and training immediately upon award of contract.</p> <p>Hours: 7:00 to 3:30 (5) days a week.  On-call staff 24 hrs. a day.</p> <p>Staffing Plan accounts for festivals, parades and Mardi Gras related events.  (See Section 5, pp. 1-3)</p>	<p>Clearwater staff will be on-site during transition</p> <p>Maintenance Crew: 7:00 to 4:00 (5 days/week)  Office Staff: Same hours as City  On call/Emergency: At least 2 employees at all times</p> <p>Clearwater will interview existing employees and will hire employees who meet the needs of the staffing plan and can pass a physical exam and drug test.</p> <p>(See Section 3, pp. 11-16)</p>
<b>Scope of Work</b>	<p><b>Service Provider will perform or provide:</b></p> <p>Operation of all divisions of the City in compliance with applicable law and regulations and reporting requirements.</p> <p>Operation of the distribution and collections system such that odor and noise shall be minimized.</p> <p>Hiring, training and employment of a sufficient number of employees to staff and operate the project.</p> <p>Training for personnel in areas of operation, maintenance, safety, supervisory skills, laboratory and energy management.</p> <p>Maintain Standard Operating Procedures for use by project staff.</p> <p>Maintain all warranties on new equipment purchased by the City and assist in enforcing existing warranties.</p> <p>Maintain the computerized maintenance system (CMMS) for the City. Cost for the system is included in the price proposal.</p> <p>Work planning and scheduling for staff using the CMMS. Equipment maintenance and repair will be done by onsite staff unless specialized expertise is required.</p> <p>Completion of an annual conditions assessment of all major equipment and components.</p>	<p><b>Service Provider will perform or provide:</b></p> <p>All maintenance and repairs.</p> <p>Grounds maintenance around wells, tanks and lift stations.</p> <p>Leak repairs, pipe installation work orders, meter reading, and meter maintenance.</p> <p>Water loss program.</p> <p>Meter change out program, valve and fire hydrant maintenance program.</p> <p>Pump maintenance.</p> <p>Equipment, vehicle, and machine maintenance.</p> <p>Fuel for Service Provider and City vehicles and equipment.</p> <p>24/7 emergency call-outs.</p> <p>Prepare standard operating procedures.</p> <p>Miscellaneous tools and equipment for routine maintenance.</p> <p>Perform a 5 yr Comprehensive Plan on sewer.</p> <p>100,000+ LF of sewer line in the first year to be smoke tested, cleaned and videoed.</p> <p>600,000 total LF within the 5 yr contract period.</p> <p>CMMS &amp; OPSWIN software programs for tracking and QA/QC in the lab and process control testing.</p> <p>Sewer cleaning/TV equipment.</p> <p>GIS/GPS Mapping.</p> <p>Engineering expertise up to \$51,000 per yr.</p> <p>Investigate radio read meters and provide labor for installation.</p> <p>Investigate Bemis Avenue and provide design and labor for remediation.</p> <p>Install pipe connecting wells and <b>provide the labor at no additional cost.</b></p>




Criteria	Utility Partners, LLC	Clearwater Solutions, LLC
<b>Scope of Work (cont.)</b>	<p>A risk management plan for the facilities which will be updated annually.</p> <p>Assist with emergency response in the event of a natural disaster. Overtime to be negotiated for reasonable compensation to UP. Will assist with seeking reimbursement from appropriate agencies.</p> <p>All under road pipeline repairs that are undertaken by UP will be accomplished following the guidelines in Appendix A of the RFP.</p> <p>Assistance to the City's engineering staff or consultants in review of any proposed project impacting water and sewer system operations.</p> <p>Compliance with City purchasing policies and procedures. A monthly report will be provided on the cost-to-date of repair parts vs. budget.</p> <p>Utility Partners' compliance with all State and Federal Permit requirements for any system or utilities project rehabilitation.</p> <p>A list of recommended capital improvements required for any facility covered under this agreement will be provided with the first 180 days.</p> <p>Capital planning and assistance to the City for expansions and modifications to the existing water and sewer systems.</p> <p>Vehicle insurance as described in Appendix D and UP will provide all vehicles required for the staff to perform their duties.</p> <p><i>(See Draft Contract, Section 7, Article 2)</i></p>	<p>Operate the water distribution system.</p> <p>Manage the Public Works Dept.</p> <p>Responsible for sewer backups, installation of sewer taps, line breaks, manhole repairs, and sewer overflow responses.</p> <p>Employ staff capable of performing routine and corrective maintenance on City owned vehicles and equipment.</p> <p>Maintain all necessary licenses, certifications and accreditations.</p> <p>Repair and maintain the system and the city's facilities and equipment.</p> <p>Provide required testing, monitoring and reporting.</p> <p>Grant assistance.</p> <p><i>(See Draft Agreement, Section 8, pp.2-4)</i></p>

Criteria	Utility Partners, LLC	Clearwater Solutions, LLC																
Additional Resources	<p>Corporate Engineering and Operations Support. Monitoring of Inflow and Infiltration (I &amp; I). Based on City budgetary limits, will correct infiltration problems where possible and will provide suggestions for future repairs such as pipe and manhole cleaning, line video recording, and lining services. (See Section 6, p. 5)</p> <p>New service software includes asset information, preventive maintenance scheduling, service procedures, staffing and reports. Assistance with developing capital expense planning for infrastructure needs. (See Section 6, pp. 37-38)</p> <p><b>Future replacement responsibilities for vehicles and equipment</b> may be assumed by UP, if requested, after negotiation of a fair adjustment to the contract price for services. (See Draft Contract, Article 3.4)</p>	<p>Predicted annual savings of \$160,000 per year based on 2013 City budget. Additional annual savings beyond the 2013 budget items include:</p> <table><tr><td>\$240,000</td><td>CCTV</td></tr><tr><td>\$40,000</td><td>GIS/GPS</td></tr><tr><td>\$100,000</td><td>Meter Change Out</td></tr><tr><td>\$51,000</td><td>Engineering</td></tr><tr><td>\$50,000</td><td>Contracted Svc.</td></tr><tr><td>\$10,000</td><td>Installation of Pipe</td></tr><tr><td>20-30%</td><td>Reduction in I &amp; I</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Grant Assistance</td></tr></table> <p>(See Section 7, pp. 1-2)</p> <p>Will also assist with capital improvement plans, assistance with rate studies, and evaluation of converting fleet to natural gas. (See Section 3, p. 12)</p> <p>After implementation of contract, the City <b>may lease or sell, some or all of the equipment and property</b> presently owned by the City and used under the contract, at fair market value. (See Section 8, Draft Agreement, p. 2, Article I.12)</p>	\$240,000	CCTV	\$40,000	GIS/GPS	\$100,000	Meter Change Out	\$51,000	Engineering	\$50,000	Contracted Svc.	\$10,000	Installation of Pipe	20-30%	Reduction in I & I		Grant Assistance
\$240,000	CCTV																	
\$40,000	GIS/GPS																	
\$100,000	Meter Change Out																	
\$51,000	Engineering																	
\$50,000	Contracted Svc.																	
\$10,000	Installation of Pipe																	
20-30%	Reduction in I & I																	
	Grant Assistance																	
Financial Arrangement	<p><b>\$1,597,000.00 per year</b></p> <p><b>Additional Cost:</b> Water mains for proposed water filtration plant: Weekly cost of one (4) man crew = \$4,200.00/wk.</p> <p><b>Annual adjustment:</b> 80% of Consumer Price Index (CPI) with a min. of 1% increase per year. (See Section 8, pp. 1-2)</p>	<p><b>\$1,757,000.00 per year</b> (See Section 7, pp. 1-2)</p> <p><b>Annual adjustment:</b> Increases/decreases in annual fee to be negotiated three months before the contract anniversary date. If no agreement on the amount of the increase/decrease, the amount will be based on the current Consumer Price Index (CPI). (See Section 8- Draft Agreement, p. 4)</p>																



Service Provider Responsibilities	Utility Partners, LLC (See Section 8, Page 1-2 and Draft Contract Article 2)	Clearwater Solutions, LLC (See Section 5, pp. 11 thru 12 and Draft Agreement Section 8, Article II)	Comments
Direct Labor (and Payroll Taxes)	X	X	
Overtime (not including disaster cleanup)	X	X	
Worker's Compensation Insurance	X	X	
Medical Insurance	X	X	
Dental Insurance	X	X	
Vision Insurance	X	X	
Life Insurance	X	X	
Retirement Plan 401 (K)	X	X	
Disability insurance	n/a	X	
Environmental Risk Insurance	X	n/a	
Professional Liability Insurance	X	X	
Umbrella Insurance Coverage	n/a	X	
Employee incentives and/or bonuses	X	X	
Education reimbursement	X	n/a	
Uniforms	X	X	
Safety Supplies	X	X	
Employee Training Costs	X	X	
Professional fees, dues, subscriptions	X	X	
Office Supplies	X	n/a	
Operating Supplies (Consumable items)	X	X	
Lab testing & compliance testing supplies	n/a	X	
Maintenance Management Software	X	X	
Computers for O & M Staff	X	G	
Computer System Maintenance	X	G	
Company issued vehicle for Mgr.	X	X	
Company issued vehicle liability insurance	X	X	
Equipment, vehicle, machine maintenance	G	X	
Fuel for Service Prov. & City vehicles and equip.	G	X	
Miscellaneous Tools and equip.-routine mainten.	n/a	X	
Mobile Phones/two-way radios	X	X	
Engineering & Operations Support	X	X	
Grant Assistance	n/a	X	
<b>Legend:</b>			
Service Provider Responsibility = X			
City of Gautier Responsibility = G			
Not addressed in proposal = n/a			
 = Different Responsibility per Service Provider			

City Responsibilities	Utility Partners, LLC (Draft Contract Article 3)	Clearwater Solutions, LLC (See Section 5, p. 11 thru 12 and Draft Agreement Section 8, Article III)	Comments
Use of office space and shop area	G	G	lease included in proposals
Capital expenditures	G	G	
Chemicals, chlorine, and degreaser	G	G	
Electrical Power at wells, lift stations and tanks	G	G	
All electricity, natural gas and related costs	G	G	
Maintenance materials	G	G	
Maintain existing warranties, guarantees, easements and licenses. State and federal fees and permits	G	G	
Registrations, insurance and licenses for City vehicles- used for project	G	G	
Service Provider use of all vehicles and equip. presently in use for the project	G	G	
Fuel	G	X	
Maintenance costs for vehicles, tires, minor repairs	G	X	
Auto tags	G	n/a	
Use of billing software	X	G	
Use of computers for billing staff	X	G	
Computer support	X	G	
Office supplies	X	G	
Current stock of maintenance parts and materials	G	G	
Building maintenance repairs	G	G	
Repair and replacement parts and materials	G	G	
Engineering/Professional services	n/a	G	
Signal and street lighting	n/a	G	
<b>Legend:</b>			
Service Provider Responsibility = X			
City of Gautier Responsibility = G			
Not addressed in proposal = n/a			
 = Different Responsibility per Service Provider			